

The classification of Novikov algebras in low dimensions

This article has been downloaded from IOPscience. Please scroll down to see the full text article.

2001 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 34 1581

(<http://iopscience.iop.org/0305-4470/34/8/305>)

View [the table of contents for this issue](#), or go to the [journal homepage](#) for more

Download details:

IP Address: 171.66.16.101

The article was downloaded on 02/06/2010 at 09:50

Please note that [terms and conditions apply](#).

The classification of Novikov algebras in low dimensions

Chengming Bai¹ and Daoji Meng²

¹ Theoretical Physics Division, Nankai Institute of Mathematics, Tianjin 300071, People's Republic of China

² Department of Mathematics, Nankai University, Tianjin 300071, People's Republic of China

Received 19 July 2000, in final form 17 November 2000

Abstract

Novikov algebras were introduced in connection with the Poisson brackets of hydrodynamic-type and Hamiltonian operators in the formal variational calculus. For further our understanding and physical applications, we give a classification of Novikov algebras in dimensions two and three in this paper.

PACS numbers: 0210, 0230

1. Introduction

One remarkable feature of Hamiltonian operators is their connection with certain algebraic structures [1–8]. Gel'fand and Dikii introduced a formal variational calculus and found certain interesting Poisson structures when they studied Hamiltonian systems related to certain nonlinear partial differential equations, such as KdV equations [1, 2]. In [3], Gel'fand and Dorfman found more connections between Hamiltonian operators and certain algebraic structures. Dubrovin, Balanskii and Novikov studied similar Poisson structures from another point of view [4–6]. One of the algebraic structures appearing in [3, 6], which is called a 'Novikov algebra' by Osborn [9–13], was introduced in connection with the Poisson brackets of hydrodynamic type.

A Novikov algebra A is a vector space over a field K with a bilinear product $(x, y) \rightarrow xy$ satisfying

$$(x_1, x_2, x_3) = (x_2, x_1, x_3) \quad (1.1)$$

and

$$(x_1x_2)x_3 = (x_1x_3)x_2 \quad (1.2)$$

for $x_1, x_2, x_3 \in A$, where

$$(x_1, x_2, x_3) = (x_1x_2)x_3 - x_1(x_2x_3). \quad (1.3)$$

Novikov algebras are a special class of left-symmetric algebras which only satisfy equation (1.1). Left-symmetric algebras are non-associative algebras arising from the study of affine manifolds, affine structures and convex homogeneous cones [14–19].

The commutator of a Novikov algebra (or a left-symmetric algebra) A

$$[x, y] = xy - yx \quad (1.4)$$

defines a Lie algebra $\mathcal{G} = \mathcal{G}(A)$. Let L_x, R_x denote the left and right multiplication, respectively, i.e. $L_x(y) = xy, R_x(y) = yx, \forall x, y \in A$. Then for a Novikov algebra, the left multiplication operators form a Lie algebra and the right multiplication operators are commutative.

Novikov asked whether there exist simple Novikov algebras (i.e. ones which contain no ideas except the zero ideal, itself and $AA \neq 0$). Zel'manov proved that a finite-dimensional simple Novikov algebra over an algebraically closed field with characteristic 0 is a field [20]. Osborn and Xu gave a complete classification of finite-dimensional simple Novikov algebras over an algebraically closed field with prime characteristic. They also found several classes of infinite-dimensional simple Novikov algebras [9–13].

Moreover, Zel'manov gave a fundamental structure theory of a finite-dimensional Novikov algebra over an algebraically closed field with characteristic 0 [20]: a Novikov algebra A is called right-nilpotent or transitive if every R_x is nilpotent. Then by equation (1.2), a finite-dimensional Novikov algebra contains the largest transitive ideal $N(A)$ and the quotient algebra $A/N(A)$ is a direct sum of fields. The transitivity corresponds to the completeness of the affine manifolds in geometry [14, 15].

Therefore, it is necessary to understand the structures and properties of transitive Novikov algebras in detail. This is still an open question, which is obviously quite difficult. Moreover, even if we can obtain some classifications of transitive Novikov algebras, we are still far from the complete classification of Novikov algebras. One of the most important reasons for this is that, unlike associative algebras, the extension by $N(A)$ is not non-essential in general. There can exist many non-isomorphic extensions. Recall that A is an extension of C by B if there exists an ideal R of A which is isomorphic to B and the quotient algebra A/R is isomorphic to C . If there exists a subalgebra H of A such that $R \cap H = \{0\}$ and $A = R + H$, then this extension is called a non-essential extension, otherwise it is called an essential extension. If, in addition, H is an ideal of A , then the extension is called a trivial extension.

In this paper, we give a classification of Novikov algebras over the complex field in dimensions two and three. As in the study of other algebras, while some special cases are understood, the full structure theory of Novikov algebras is yet to be developed. The study of the low-dimensional cases will serve as a guide for further development.

The paper is organized as follows. Section 2 gives the classification of two-dimensional Novikov algebras. Section 3 describes the classification of transitive Novikov algebras in dimension three. Section 4 describes the classification of non-transitive Novikov algebras in dimension three. In section 5 we give our discussion for the classifications used in the previous sections.

2. Two-dimensional Novikov algebras

Let $\{e_i\}$ be a basis of a Novikov algebra A . Set $A_{ij} = e_i e_j = \sum_{k=1}^n a_{ij}^k e_k$. Then the (form) characteristic matrix $\mathcal{A} = (A_{ij})$, i.e.

$$\mathcal{A} = \begin{pmatrix} \sum_{k=1}^n a_{11}^k e_k & \cdots & \sum_{k=1}^n a_{1n}^k e_k \\ \cdots & \cdots & \cdots \\ \sum_{k=1}^n a_{n1}^k e_k & \cdots & \sum_{k=1}^n a_{nn}^k e_k \end{pmatrix}. \quad (2.1)$$

Table 1. The classification and some basic properties of two-dimensional Novikov algebras.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	$N(A)$	Ext. by $N(A)$
(T1) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	$A = N(A)$	Transitive
(T2) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	$A = N(A)$	Transitive
(T3) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ -e_1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	$[e_1, e_2] = e_1$	$A = N(A)$	Transitive
(N1) $\begin{pmatrix} e_1 & 0 \\ 0 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	$N(A) = \{0\}$	$A \cong C \oplus C$
(N2) $\begin{pmatrix} e_1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	(T0)	Trivial
(N3) $\begin{pmatrix} e_1 & e_2 \\ e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	(T0)	Non-essential
(N4) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Isomorphic to (T3)	(T0)	Non-essential
(N5) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_1 + e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (T3)	(T0)	Essential
(N6) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & e_1 \\ le_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 0, 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (T3)	(T0)	Non-essential

There are two Novikov algebras in dimension one: the complex field $C = \{Ce|ee = e\}$ and the one-dimensional trivial Novikov algebra (T0) = $\{Ce|ee = 0\}$. In [17, 19], the classification of two-dimensional left-symmetric algebras is given. Then by the condition $R_{e_1}R_{e_2} = R_{e_2}R_{e_1}$, we can obtain the classification of two-dimensional Novikov algebras given in table 1.

3. Three-dimensional transitive Novikov algebras

Let A be a three-dimensional transitive Novikov algebra. By Engel’s theorem, there exists a basis $\{e_1, e_2, e_3\}$, such that $R_{e_1}, R_{e_2}, R_{e_3}$ can be put into strictly upper triangular matrices simultaneously, that is, we can assume

$$R_{e_1} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & a_1 & b_1 \\ 0 & 0 & c_1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \quad R_{e_2} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & a_2 & b_2 \\ 0 & 0 & c_2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \quad R_{e_3} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & a_3 & b_3 \\ 0 & 0 & c_3 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}. \tag{3.1}$$

By the commutativity of R_{e_i} and R_{e_j} , we have

$$a_1c_2 = a_2c_1 \quad a_2c_3 = a_3c_2 \quad a_1c_3 = a_3c_1. \tag{3.2}$$

Thus, we have

$$c_1 = c_2 = c_3 = 0 \tag{3.3}$$

or we can assume

$$a_1 = tc_1 \quad a_2 = tc_2 \quad a_3 = tc_3. \tag{3.4}$$

Through equation (1.1), we have the following equations:

$$(e_1, e_3, e_1) = (e_3, e_1, e_1) \implies a_1c_1 = 0 \quad (3.5)$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_2) = (e_3, e_1, e_2) \implies a_2c_1 = 0 \quad (3.6)$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_1, e_3) \implies a_3c_1 = 0 \quad (3.7)$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_1) = (e_3, e_2, e_1) \implies a_1c_2 + a_2c_1 = 0 \quad (3.8)$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_2) = (e_3, e_2, e_2) \implies a_2b_1 - a_1b_2 - 2a_2c_2 = 0 \quad (3.9)$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_2, e_3) \implies a_3b_1 - a_1b_3 - a_2c_3 - a_3c_2 = 0. \quad (3.10)$$

The relations for other items hold automatically. So the problem turns into one of how to determine the above parameters and the isomorphic classes of Novikov algebras that they define. From equations (3.3) and (3.4), we know $\{a_i, b_i, c_i\}$ must be in the following cases.

Case (I). $t = 0$. We will show that this implies $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = 0$.

Case (II). $c_1 = c_2 = c_3 = 0$.

Case (III). One of a_i and one of c_j are not zero.

Next we discuss these three cases.

Case (I). This is the case where equation (3.4) holds and $t = 0$. Thus we have $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = 0$. One verifies that equations (3.5)–(3.10) hold in this case. It is easy to see that the linear subspace V spanned by e_1 and e_2 is a trivial ideal. Hence V is stable under L_{e_3} . Then we can choose a new basis in V such that under this new basis L_{e_3} becomes

$$L_{e_3} = \begin{pmatrix} b'_1 & 0 \\ 0 & c'_2 \end{pmatrix} \quad \text{or} \quad L_{e_3} = \begin{pmatrix} b'_1 & 1 \\ 0 & b'_1 \end{pmatrix}. \quad (3.11)$$

The former shows that we can assume $c_1 = b_2 = 0$, and the latter case shows that we can assume $b_1 = c_2, c_1 = 0, b_2 = 1$. Next we discuss these two cases.

Case (I-1). The characteristic matrix is

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ b_1e_1 & c_2e_2 & b_3e_1 + c_3e_2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(i) $b_1 = c_2 = b_3 = c_3 = 0$. We have type (A1)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(ii) $b_1 = c_2 = 0; b_3 \neq 0$ or $c_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow b_3e_1 + c_3e_2$, we have type (A2)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(iii) $b_1 = 0, c_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow \frac{1}{c_2}e_3$, we can assume $c_2 = 1$.

(1) $b_3 = c_3 = 0$. We have type (A9)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(2) $b_3 \neq 0, c_3 = 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow b_3e_1$, we have type (A10)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_2 & e_1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(3) $b_3 = 0, c_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow e_3 - c_3e_2$, then this is case (I-1-iii-1).

(4) $b_3 \neq 0, c_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow b_3e_1; e_3 \rightarrow e_3 - c_3e_2$, then this is case (I-1-iii-2).

(iv) $b_1 \neq 0, c_2 = 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow e_2, e_2 \rightarrow e_1$, then this is case (I-1-iii);

(v) $b_1 \neq 0, c_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow \frac{1}{b_1}e_3 - \frac{b_3}{b_1^2}e_1 - \frac{c_3}{b_1c_2}e_2$, then (non-zero products)

$$e_3e_1 = e_1 \quad e_3e_2 = \frac{c_2}{b_1}e_2 \quad e_3e_3 = 0.$$

If $|\frac{c_2}{b_1}| > 1$, then after letting $e_1 \rightarrow e_2, e_2 \rightarrow e_1, e_3 \rightarrow \frac{b_1}{c_2}e_3$, we can assume $|l| \leq 1, l \neq 0$, where $l = \frac{c_2}{b_1}$. Thus we have type (A11)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ e_1 & le_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

with $|l| \leq 1, l \neq 0$.

Case (I-2). The characteristic matrix is

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ b_1e_1 & e_1 + b_1e_2 & b_3e_1 + c_3e_2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(i) $b_1 = 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow e_3 - b_3e_2$, we can assume $b_3 = 0$.

(1) $c_3 = 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow e_2 + e_3, e_3 \rightarrow -e_3 + e_2$, we have

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_1 \\ 0 & -e_1 & -e_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

which is type (A6) (see case (II-2-i-2)) with $l = -1$;

(2) $c_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow c_3e_2$, we have type (A8)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(ii) $b_1 \neq 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow \frac{1}{b_1}e_1, e_3 \rightarrow \frac{1}{b_1}e_3 + (\frac{c_3}{b_1^2} - \frac{b_3}{b_1^2})e_1 - \frac{c_3}{b_1^2}e_2$, we have type (A12)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ e_1 & e_1 + e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Case (II). This is the case where equation (3.3) holds. One can easily show that equations (3.5)–(3.8) hold. From equations (3.9) and (3.10), we have

$$a_2b_1 = a_1b_2 \quad a_3b_1 = a_1b_3. \quad (3.12)$$

The characteristic matrix is

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ a_1e_1 & a_2e_1 & a_3e_1 \\ b_1e_1 & b_2e_1 & b_3e_1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

We can assume one of a_i is not zero.

Case (II-1). $b_1 = b_2 = b_3 = 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow e_3, e_3 \rightarrow e_2$, Then we can see this is in case (I), i.e. $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = 0$.

Case (II-2). $b_1 = 0$, and one of b_2 and b_3 is not zero: by equation (3.12), we have $a_1b_2 = a_1b_3 = 0$. Hence $a_1 = 0$, otherwise $b_2 = b_3 = 0$. Note $a_2 \neq 0$ or $a_3 \neq 0$ by our assumption.

(i) $a_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow a_2e_1$, then the characteristic matrix can be written as

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & a_3e_1 \\ 0 & b_2e_1 & b_3e_1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(1) $a_3 = b_2$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow e_3 - b_2e_2$, we can assume $a_3 = b_2 = 0$. Thus, by our assumption, $b_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow \sqrt{b_3}e_3$, we have type (A3)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(2) $a_3 \neq b_2$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow \frac{2}{a_3-b_2}e_3 - \frac{a_3+b_2}{a_3-b_2}e_2$, we have type (A6)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_1 \\ 0 & -e_1 & le_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

where

$$l = \frac{4b_3 - (a_3 + b_2)^2}{(a_3 - b_2)^2}.$$

(ii) $a_2 = 0$. We can assume $b_3 = 0$, otherwise, after letting $e_2 \rightarrow e_3, e_3 \rightarrow e_2$, this case is changed into case (II-2-i).

(1) $a_3 = -b_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow e_2 + e_3, e_3 \rightarrow \frac{1}{2a_3}(e_3 - e_2)$, we have type (A5)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & -e_1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(2) $a_3 + b_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow e_2 + e_3$, then this is in case (II-2-i).

Case (II-3) $b_1 \neq 0$.

- (i) $b_2 = 0$. Then by equation (3.12), $a_2 = 0$. Moreover, $a_1 \neq 0$, otherwise $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = 0$.
 - (1) $a_3 = 0$. By equation (3.12), $b_3 = 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow e_2 - \frac{a_1}{b_1}e_3$, $e_2 \rightarrow e_1$, $e_3 \rightarrow \frac{1}{b_1}e_3$, this is case (I-1-iii-1), i.e. type A(9).
 - (2) $a_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow e_2 - \frac{a_1}{b_1}e_3$. Since $\frac{b_3}{a_3} = \frac{b_1}{a_1} \neq 0$, this is in case (I).
- (ii) $b_2 \neq 0$. If $b_3 = 0$, then by equation (3.12), we have $a_3 = 0$. Moreover, $a_1 \neq 0$, $a_2 \neq 0$, otherwise $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow e_2$, $e_2 \rightarrow e_3$, this is in case (I) since $\frac{b_1}{a_1} = \frac{b_2}{a_2} \neq 0$. If $b_3 \neq 0$, then $a_1 \neq 0$, $a_2 \neq 0$, $a_3 \neq 0$, otherwise $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow e_2 - \frac{a_1}{b_1}e_3$, this is still in case (I) since $\frac{b_1}{a_1} = \frac{b_2}{a_2} = \frac{b_3}{a_3} \neq 0$.

Case (III). This is the case where equation (3.4) holds and $t \neq 0$, and one of c_i is not zero. And one of a_i is not zero, too. Then we have $c_1 = 0$ by equations (3.5)–(3.7). Hence $a_1 = 0$ and $b_1 = 2c_2$ by equation (3.4) and equations (3.8)–(3.10). We assume c_i cannot be zero at all.

Case (III-1) $c_2 = b_1 = 0$. In this case, we have $a_2 = 0$ by equation (3.4) and $c_3 \neq 0$ by our assumption. Let $e_1 \rightarrow tc_3e_1$, the characteristic matrix can be assumed to be

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & b_2e_1 & b_3e_1 + c_3e_2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

- (i) $b_2 \neq -1$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow e_3 - \frac{b_3}{b_2+1}e_2$, $e_2 \rightarrow c_3e_2$, then the characteristic matrix can be written as

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & b_2e_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

We divide them into two classes: associative case only and only if $b_2 = 1$, which is type (A4)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

and non-associative case only and only if $b_2 \neq 1$, which is type (A7)

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & le_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

with $l = b_2 \neq 1, -1$.

- (ii) $b_2 = -1$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow c_3e_1$, $e_2 \rightarrow c_3e_2 + b_3e_1$, we have

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & -e_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

which is type (A7) with $l = -1$.

Table 2. The classification and some basic properties of three-dimensional transitive Novikov algebras.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	Remark
(A1) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	$(T0) \oplus (T1)$
(A2) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	$(T0) \oplus (T2)$
(A3) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	
(A4) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	
(A5) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & -e_1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_2] = e_1$	
(A6) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_1 \\ 0 & -e_1 & le_1 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Isomorphic to (A5)	
(A7) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & le_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A5)	
(A8) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A5)	
(A9) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_2] = e_2$	$(T0) \oplus (T3)$
(A10) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_2 & e_1 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	
(A11) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ e_1 & le_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$ $ l \leq 1, l \neq 0$	Non-associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = e_1$ $[e_3, e_2] = le_2$ $ l \leq 1, l \neq 0$	
(A12) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ e_1 & e_1 + e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = e_1$ $[e_3, e_2] = e_1 + e_2$	
(A13) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & 0 \\ e_1 & \frac{1}{2}e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = e_1$ $[e_3, e_2] = \frac{1}{2}e_2$	$\mathcal{G}(A)$ is (A11) with $l = \frac{1}{2}$

Case (III-2) $b_1 = 2c_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_1 \rightarrow tc_2e_1, e_3 \rightarrow \frac{1}{2c_2}e_3 - \frac{b_3}{4c_2^2}e_1$, then the characteristic matrix can be written as

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & c_3 \!/\! e_1 \\ e_1 & b_2 \!/\! e_1 + \frac{1}{2}e_2 & \frac{c_3 \!/\!}{2}e_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

where $b_2 \!/\! = \frac{b_2}{2c_2}, c_3 \!/\! = \frac{c_3}{2c_2^2}$.

(i) $c_3 \neq 0$.

(1) $b_2 \neq 0$. We have type (A13),

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_1 & 0 \\ e_1 & \frac{1}{2}e_2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(2) $b_2 \neq 0$. Let $e_2 \rightarrow b_2 \neq 0 e_2 - 2b_2 \neq 0^2 e_1, e_1 \rightarrow b_2 \neq 0^2 e_1$, then it is isomorphic to type (A13).

(ii) $c_3 \neq 0$. Let $e_3 \rightarrow e_3 + b_2 \neq 0 c_3 \neq 0 e_1 - c_3 \neq 0 e_2$, then

$$e_2 e_3 = e_3 e_2 = 0 \quad e_1 e_3 = (b_2 \neq 0 - c_3 \neq 0) e_1 + \frac{1}{2} e_2 \quad e_1 e_2 = 0 \quad e_3 e_1 = e_1.$$

This is in case (III-2-i).

We summarize the above results in table 2. In the second and the third columns, we indicate the associativity of the algebra and the structure of the Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$. One can show the algebras in the table that are mutually non-isomorphic.

4. Three-dimensional non-transitive Novikov algebras

Using the introduction, we discuss the three-dimensional non-transitive Novikov algebras in the following cases: the cases $N(A) = \{0\}$, $N(A) = (T0)$, $N(A) = (T1)$, $N(A) = (T2)$ and $N(A) = (T3)$, respectively.

Case (1) $N(A) = \{0\}$. In this case, there is only one Novikov structure, that is, the direct sum of the fields

$$A = C \oplus C \oplus C. \tag{4.1}$$

Case (2) $N(A) = (T0)$. We can choose a basis e_1, e_2, e_3 such that

$$e_1 e_1 = 0 \quad e_1 e_i = a_{1i} e_1 \quad e_i e_1 = a_{i1} e_1 \quad e_i e_j = \delta_{ij} e_i + a_{ij} e_1 \quad i = 2, 3 \tag{4.2}$$

where $\delta_{ij} = 1$ if $i = j$ and $\delta_{ij} = 0$ if $i \neq j$. Then we have

$$R_{e_1} R_{e_2} = R_{e_2} R_{e_1} \implies (a_{12} - 1)a_{21} = 0 \quad a_{31}a_{12} = 0 \tag{4.3}$$

$$R_{e_1} R_{e_3} = R_{e_3} R_{e_1} \implies (a_{13} - 1)a_{31} = 0 \quad a_{21}a_{13} = 0 \tag{4.4}$$

$$R_{e_2} R_{e_3} = R_{e_3} R_{e_2} \implies (a_{12} - 1)a_{23} = a_{13}a_{22} \quad (a_{13} - 1)a_{32} = a_{12}a_{33} \tag{4.5}$$

$$(e_1, e_2, e_2) = (e_2, e_1, e_2) \implies a_{12}^2 = a_{12} \tag{4.6}$$

$$(e_1, e_2, e_3) = (e_2, e_1, e_3) \implies a_{12}a_{13} = 0 \tag{4.7}$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_1, e_3) \implies a_{13}^2 = a_{13} \tag{4.8}$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_2) = (e_3, e_2, e_2) \implies a_{23}a_{23} - a_{21}a_{32} = a_{32}a_{12} - a_{32} - a_{22}a_{31} \tag{4.9}$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_2, e_3) \implies a_{13}a_{32} - a_{23}a_{31} = a_{23}a_{13} - a_{23} - a_{21}a_{33}. \tag{4.10}$$

The relations for other items hold automatically. Using the same method as in section 3, we can give the classification in table 3.

Table 3. The classification and some basic properties of three-dimensional Novikov algebras with $N(A) = (T0)$.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	Ext. by $N(A)$	Remark
(B1) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Trivial	$(N2) \oplus C$
(B2) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \\ e_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Non-essential	$(N3) \oplus C$
(B3) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Non-essential	$(N4) \oplus C$
(B4) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 + e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Essential	$(N5) \oplus C$
(B5) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & e_2 & 0 \\ le_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 0, 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Non-essential	$(N6) \oplus C$

Case (3) $N(A) = (T1)$. We can choose a basis e_1, e_2, e_3 such that

$$\begin{aligned} e_1e_1 = e_1e_2 = e_2e_1 = e_2e_2 = 0 & \quad e_3e_3 = e_3 + a_{33}e_1 + b_{33}e_2 \\ e_ie_3 = a_{i3}e_1 + b_{i3}e_2 & \quad e_3e_i = a_{3i}e_1 + b_{3i}e_2 \quad i = 1, 2. \end{aligned} \tag{4.11}$$

Then we have

$$R_{e_1}R_{e_3} = R_{e_3}R_{e_1} \implies a_{13}a_{32} + a_{23}b_{32} = a_{32} \quad a_{32}b_{13} + b_{23}b_{32} = b_{32} \tag{4.12}$$

$$R_{e_2}R_{e_3} = R_{e_3}R_{e_2} \implies a_{13}a_{31} + a_{23}b_{31} = a_{31} \quad a_{31}b_{13} + b_{23}b_{31} = b_{31}. \tag{4.13}$$

By the relation $(e_1, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_1, e_3)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} a_{13}^2 + a_{23}b_{13} - a_{13} &= a_{23}b_{31} - a_{32}b_{13} \\ b_{13}(a_{13} + b_{23} - a_{31} + b_{32} - 1) &= b_{31}(b_{23} - a_{13}). \end{aligned} \tag{4.14}$$

By the relation $(e_2, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_2, e_3)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} b_{23}^2 + a_{23}b_{13} - b_{23} &= a_{32}b_{13} - a_{23}b_{31} \\ a_{23}(a_{13} + b_{23} + a_{31} - b_{32} - 1) &= a_{32}(-b_{23} + a_{13}). \end{aligned} \tag{4.15}$$

The relations for other items hold automatically. However, the above equations are still complicated. Note that $N(A)$ is an ideal of A , thus $N(A)$ is a stable subspace of the linear transformations L_{e_3} and R_{e_3} . Because the field is complex by our supposition, there exists $e'_1, e'_2 \in N(A)$, such that

$$e_3e'_1 = \alpha e'_1 \quad e'_2e_3 = \beta e'_2. \tag{4.16}$$

Hence by a linear transformation $e_1 \rightarrow e'_1, e_2 \rightarrow e'_2$, we can suppose that $b_{31} = a_{23} = 0$. So equations (4.12)–(4.15) become

$$(a_{13} - 1)a_{32} = (a_{13} - 1)a_{31} = a_{32}(a_{13} - b_{23}) = b_{13}a_{31} = 0 \tag{4.17}$$

$$-a_{13}(a_{13} - 1) = b_{23}(b_{23} - 1) = -b_{32}(b_{23} - 1) = b_{13}a_{32} \tag{4.18}$$

$$b_{13}(a_{13} + b_{23} - a_{31} + b_{32} - 1) = 0. \tag{4.19}$$

Using the same method as in section 3, we can give the classification in table 4.

Table 4. The classification and some basic properties of three-dimensional Novikov algebras with $N(A) = (T1)$.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	Ext. by $N(A)$	Remark
(C1) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Trivial	$(N2) \oplus (T0)$
(C2) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ e_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Non-essential	$(N3) \oplus (T0)$
(C3) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Non-essential	$(N4) \oplus (T0)$
(C4) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_1 + e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Essential	$(N5) \oplus (T0)$
(C5) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ le_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 0, 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Non-essential	$(N6) \oplus (T0)$
(C6) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Non-essential	
(C7) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 & 0 & e_3 + e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Essential	
(C8) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = e_1$ $[e_3, e_2] = e_2$	Non-essential	$\mathcal{G}(A)$ is (A11) with $l = 1$
(C9) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ le_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 1, 0$	Non-associative	$[e_2, e_1] = 0$ $[e_3, e_1] = le_1$ $[e_3, e_2] = e_2$ $ l \leq 1, l \neq 0, 1$	Non-essential	$\mathcal{G}(A)$ is (A11) with $l \neq 1$
(C10) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ le_1 & 0 & e_3 + e_2 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A11)	Essential	
(C11) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 & e_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Non-essential	
(C12) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 & le_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 0, 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A9)	Non-essential	
(C13) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ le_1 & ke_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l, k \neq 1, 0$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A11)	Non-essential	
(C14) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 & e_1 + e_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to A(5)	Non-essential	
(C15) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ le_1 & e_1 + le_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq 1, 0$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A12)	Non-essential	
(C16) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to A(12)	Non-essential	

Table 4. Continued.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	Ext. by $N(A)$	Remark
(C17) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ 0 & e_1 & e_3 + e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to A(12)	Essential	
(C18) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 + e_2 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ 0 & -e_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to A(13)	Non-essential	
(C19) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & e_1 + e_2 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ 0 & -e_2 & e_3 + e_1 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to A(13)	Essential	

Case (4) $N(A) = (T2)$. We can choose a basis e_1, e_2, e_3 such that

$$\begin{aligned} e_1 e_2 = e_2 e_1 = e_2 e_2 = 0 & \quad e_1 e_1 = e_2 & \quad e_3 e_3 = e_3 + a_{33} e_1 + b_{33} e_2 \\ e_i e_3 = a_{i3} e_1 + b_{i3} e_2 & \quad e_3 e_i = a_{3i} e_1 + b_{3i} e_2 & \quad i = 1, 2. \end{aligned} \quad (4.20)$$

Then we have

$$R_{e_1} R_{e_2} = R_{e_2} R_{e_1} \implies a_{32} = 0 \quad (4.21)$$

$$R_{e_2} R_{e_3} = R_{e_3} R_{e_2} \implies a_{13} a_{32} + a_{23} b_{32} = a_{32} \quad a_{32} b_{13} + b_{23} b_{32} = b_{32} \quad (4.22)$$

$$R_{e_1} R_{e_3} = R_{e_3} R_{e_1} \implies \begin{cases} a_{23} = 0 & a_{13} = b_{23} \\ a_{13} a_{31} + a_{23} b_{31} = a_{31} \\ a_{31} b_{13} + b_{23} b_{31} = b_{31} + a_{33} \end{cases} \quad (4.23)$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_1) = (e_3, e_1, e_1) \implies b_{23} + b_{32} = 2a_{31} \quad (4.24)$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_1, e_3) \implies b_{23}^2 - b_{23} = 0 \quad b_{13}(2b_{23} - a_{31} + b_{32} - 1) = a_{33}. \quad (4.25)$$

The relations for other items hold automatically. Using the same method as in section 3, we can give the classification in table 5.

Case (5) $N(A) = (T3)$. We can choose a basis e_1, e_2, e_3 such that

$$\begin{aligned} e_1 e_1 = e_1 e_2 = e_2 e_2 = 0 & \quad e_2 e_1 = -e_1 & \quad e_3 e_3 = e_3 + a_{33} e_1 + b_{33} e_2 \\ e_i e_3 = a_{i3} e_1 + b_{i3} e_2 & \quad e_3 e_i = a_{3i} e_1 + b_{3i} e_2 & \quad i = 1, 2. \end{aligned} \quad (4.26)$$

Then we have

$$R_{e_1} R_{e_2} = R_{e_2} R_{e_1} \implies b_{32} = 0 \quad (4.27)$$

$$R_{e_2} R_{e_3} = R_{e_3} R_{e_2} \implies a_{13} a_{32} + a_{23} b_{32} = a_{32} \quad a_{32} b_{13} + b_{23} b_{32} = b_{32} \quad (4.28)$$

$$R_{e_1} R_{e_3} = R_{e_3} R_{e_1} \implies \begin{cases} b_{13} = 0 & a_{13} = b_{23} \\ a_{13} a_{31} + a_{23} b_{31} = a_{31} - b_{33} \\ a_{31} b_{13} + b_{23} b_{31} = b_{31} \end{cases} \quad (4.29)$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_1) = (e_3, e_1, e_1) \implies b_{31} = 0 \quad (4.30)$$

$$(e_1, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_1, e_3) \implies b_{23}^2 - b_{23} = b_{31} a_{23} \quad (4.31)$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_1) = (e_3, e_2, e_1) \implies b_{23} = 0 \quad (4.32)$$

$$(e_2, e_3, e_3) = (e_3, e_2, e_3) \implies a_{23}(2b_{23} + a_{31} - 1) = -a_{33} - b_{23} a_{32}. \quad (4.33)$$

Table 5. The classification and some basic properties of three-dimensional Novikov algebras with $N(A) = (T2)$.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	Ext. by $N(A)$	Remark
(D1) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Trivial	$(T2) \oplus C$
(D2) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 & e_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Associative	Abelian	Non-essential	
(D3) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ e_1 + e_2 & e_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A5)	Non-essential	
(D4) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ \frac{1}{2}e_1 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A13)	Non-essential	
(D5) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ \frac{1}{2}e_1 & 0 & e_3 + e_2 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A13)	Essential	
(D6) $\begin{pmatrix} e_2 & 0 & e_1 \\ 0 & 0 & e_2 \\ le_1 & (2l - 1)e_2 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$ $l \neq \frac{1}{2}, 1$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to (A13)	Non-essential	

Table 6. The classification and some basic properties of three-dimensional Novikov algebras with $N(A) = (T3)$.

Characteristic matrix	Associativity	Lie algebra $\mathcal{G}(A)$	Ext. by $N(A)$	Remark
(E1) $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ -e_1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & e_3 \end{pmatrix}$	Non-associative	Isomorphic to A(6)	Trivial	$(T3) \oplus C$

The relations for other items hold automatically. Hence, equations (4.27)–(4.33) become

$$a_{13} = b_{13} = b_{31} = b_{23} = a_{32} = b_{32} = 0 \quad a_{33} = a_{23}(1 - a_{31}) \quad b_{33} = a_{31}. \quad (4.34)$$

Let

$$e'_1 = e_1 \quad e'_2 = e_2 \quad e'_3 = e_3 + a_{31}e_2 + a_{23}e_1. \quad (4.35)$$

Then A is isomorphic to table 6.

5. Conclusion and discussion

From the classification of Novikov algebras in dimensions two and three given in the previous sections, we can obtain the following:

1. all three-dimensional left-symmetric transitive algebras whose sub-adjacent Lie algebras are nilpotent are Novikov algebras [14];
2. there exists a one-dimensional trivial ideal in any three-dimensional non-semisimple Novikov algebra;
3. unlike some other special left-symmetric algebras [17–19], according to the classification of three-dimensional Lie algebras, there exist (transitive) Novikov algebra structures in any three-dimensional non-semisimple Lie algebra.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported in part by the National Natural Science Foundation of China, the Project for Young Mainstay Teachers and the Scientific Research Foundation for the Returned Overseas Chinese Scholars, State Education Ministry of China. We thank Professor X Xu for communicating to us his research in this field and the referees for useful suggestion. The second author also thanks Professor Xu for the hospitality extended to him during his stay at Hong Kong University of Science and Technology and the valuable discussions.

References

- [1] Gel'fand I M and Diki L A 1975 *Russ. Math. Surv.* **30** 77–113
- [2] Gel'fand I M and Diki L A 1976 *Funct. Anal. Appl.* **10** 16–22
- [3] Gel'fand I M and Dorfman I Ya 1979 *Funct. Anal. Appl.* **13** 248–62
- [4] Dubrovin B A and Novikov S P 1983 *Sov. Math. Dokl.* **27** 665–9
- [5] Dubrovin B A and Novikov S P 1984 *Sov. Math. Dokl.* **30** 651–4
- [6] Balinskii A A and Novikov S P 1985 *Sov. Math. Dokl.* **32** 228–31
- [7] Xu X 1995 *Lett. Math. Phys.* **33** 1–6
- [8] Xu X 1995 *J. Phys. A: Math. Gen.* **28** 1681–98
- [9] Osborn J M 1992 *Nova J. Algebra Geom.* **1** 1–14
- [10] Osborn J M 1992 *Commun. Algebra* **20** 2729–53
- [11] Osborn J M 1994 *J. Algebra* **167** 146–67
- [12] Xu X 1996 *J. Algebra* **185** 905–34
- [13] Xu X 1997 *J. Algebra* **190** 253–79
- [14] Kim H 1986 *J. Diff. Geom.* **24** 373–94
- [15] Vinberg E B 1963 *Mosc. Math. Soc.* **12** 340–403 (Engl. transl.)
- [16] Kim H 1987 *Algebras, Groups Geom.* **4** 73–117
- [17] Bai C M and Meng D J 1996 *Chin. Sci. Bull.* **23** 2207 (in Chinese)
- [18] Bai C M and Meng D J 2000 *Commun. Algebra* **28** 2717–34
- [19] Burde D 1998 *Manuscripta Math.* **95** 397–411
- [20] Zel'manov E I 1987 *Sov. Math. Dokl.* **35** 216–8